Evidences

Study #2171

Contributing Projects:
- P688 - 4.1.2 Improving Design and Delivery of Social protection for Nutrition and Other Outcomes
- P582 - 2.4.7 MENA Regional Policy Engagement

Part I: Public communications

Type: OICR: Outcome Impact Case Report
Status: On-going
Year: 2018

Title: Enhancing the impacts of Egypt's national cash transfer program for the very poor

Short outcome/impact statement:
Lessons from the impact evaluation of Egypt’s cash transfer “Takaful and Karama” program conducted by PIM contributed to the decision of the Government of Egypt to continue to fund this program and to the World Bank’s decision to continue to support it. The Government of Egypt adopted several recommendations from the evaluation, including on how to improve targeting by increasing awareness about the program among the very poor.
Outcome story for communications use:
Enhancing the impacts of Egypt's national cash transfer program for the very poor

In 2015, Egypt's Ministry of Social Solidarity, with support from the World Bank, launched the “Takaful and Karama” Programme, Egypt's first national conditional cash transfer. Takaful (Solidarity) transfers target poor households with children. Karama (Dignity) transfers target the elderly poor, people with disabilities, and orphans.

In 2017, PIM undertook a study to evaluate the program, and found positive impacts on the well-being of households, including consumption of higher-quality food, improved access to health services, and increased spending on children’s education.

PIM research was highlighted at the Third Annual Takaful and Karama Conference [1] that took place on November 22, 2018 in Cairo and was attended by several high-level policy makers including the Prime Minister, Minister of Social Solidarity, Minister of International Cooperation, Minister of Education, Minister of Supply and Internal Trade, Minister of Tourism, and a representative from the Ministry of Health. PIM policy briefs (in English [2] and Arabic) were distributed to all participants.

Statements [3] made during the event demonstrate that the government has adopted several of the evaluation's recommendations: the program will be continued; an awareness campaign targeting Takaful beneficiaries will be launched to improve the impacts on the very poor; and an action plan towards the implementation of a comprehensive Social Protection Strategy is being drawn.

The Ministry of Social Solidarity and the World Bank have indicated interest in tasking the team with a follow-up evaluation study to learn more about the program and its impacts, especially in the area of women’s empowerment.

Links to any communications materials relating to this outcome: <Not Defined>

Part II: CGIAR system level reporting

Link to Common Results Reporting Indicator of Policies: Yes

Policies contribution:
● 26 - Egypt’s Takaful and Karama Cash Transfer Program (improved targeting criteria)

Stage of maturity of change reported: Stage 1

Links to the Strategic Results Framework:
Sub-IDOs:
● Increased access to diverse nutrient-rich foods
● Optimized consumption of diverse nutrient-rich foods

Is this OICR linked to some SRF 2022/2030 target?: Yes

SRF 2022/2030 targets:
● # of more people, of which 50% are women, meeting minimum dietary energy requirements
● # of people, of which 50% are women, assisted to exit poverty
Description of activity / study: The evaluation showed that Egypt’s cash transfer program increased household consumption and reduced the probability of a beneficiary household being poor (income below $1.90/person/day) during a period of economic reform and substantial increases in food prices. The evaluation also showed that the program improves diets, increasing average spending on fruit, beef and chicken. Another finding is that the program appears to have led to a worsening of women’s control over decision-making in the household.

**Geographic scope:**
- National

Country(ies):
- Egypt

Comments: <Not Defined>

**Key Contributors:**
Contributing CRPs/Platforms:
- PIM - Policies, Institutions, and Markets

Contributing Flagships:
- F4: Social Protection for Agriculture and Resilience
- F2: Economywide Factors Affecting Agricultural Growth and Rural Transformation

Contributing Regional programs: <Not Defined>

Contributing external partners:
- IFPRI - International Food Policy Research Institute
- Government of Egypt
- AUC - American University in Cairo
- CILAS - Cairo Institute of Liberal Arts and Sciences
- The World Bank

**CGIAR innovation(s) or findings that have resulted in this outcome or impact:**
N/A

**Innovations:** <Not Defined>
Elaboration of Outcome/Impact Statement:
IFPRI/PIM researchers conducted a World-Bank-funded impact evaluation of Egypt’s national social protection program, the “Takaful and Karama” conditional cash transfer program. The study found that the program increased the value of household consumption, improved diets through higher spending on fruit and animal source foods, increased spending on education, and reduced the likelihood of being poor (less than $1.90/person/day) among beneficiary households. Another finding is the program’s mixed results on women’s empowerment in the household.

Results from the draft quantitative impact evaluation report prompted Egypt’s Ministry of Social Solidarity (MOSS) to request additional qualitative assessments from the IFPRI team to learn about beneficiary perceptions about the program and whether impacts were likely to differ between the households with income close to the poverty line and ultra-poor households. During a meeting in May 2018, senior MOSS staff indicated that some recommendations from the PIM study, about targeting beneficiaries with messaging related to women’s empowerment and removing some of the restrictions on eligibility, were in line with the changes considered by MOSS: including women’s issues in the outreach, and changing the exclusion criteria so that fishermen required to get insurance for their boats were not excluded from the program. The PIM finding that urban poor household are especially likely to be excluded from the program prompted MOSS staff to consider how NGOs could be used to help with outreach in urban areas.

The evaluation contributed to a dialogue about the program between MOSS, the Ministry of Finance, the President’s office and the World Bank. The main findings of the impact evaluation were presented at a MOSS Seminar on October 21, 2018, with about 100 people in attendance [4]. Following that event, the Minister of Social Solidarity presented the evaluation findings on November 22, 2018 at the Third Annual Takaful and Karama Conference [1], which was attended by 300 people including the Prime Minister and several Ministers. Hardcopies of IFPRI’s policy briefs in both English [2] and Arabic were included in the conference folders. Some of the statements [3] made by government staff during the event demonstrate that the government has adopted several of the recommendations from the evaluation, including how to improve targeting by increasing awareness about the program among the very poor.

Both MOSS and the World Bank have indicated interest in a follow-up evaluation study to learn more about the program and its impacts.

References cited:
[3] E-mails between IFPRI staff Sikandra Kurdi, Clemens Breisinger and Daniel Gilligan, citing statements made during the Takaful and Karama program-related events

Quantification: <Not Defined>
Gender, Youth, Capacity Development and Climate Change:

**Gender relevance:** 1 - Significant

Main achievements with specific Gender relevance: Several findings of the program’s impact evaluation are focused on women’s empowerment. Quantitatively, the program has a negative impact on women’s ability to influence decision making. Women’s labor supply in income generating activities was also found to be lower among beneficiaries. Finally, women who received transfers were significantly less likely to be interviewed alone during the survey. If a continuation of the study is approved by the Ministry of Social Solidarity, these findings will be further investigated.

**Youth relevance:** 0 - Not Targeted

**CapDev relevance:** 1 - Significant

Main achievements with specific CapDev relevance: Through several rounds of reporting on the findings of the impact evaluation, the IFPRI team shared lessons with the Ministry of Social Solidarity about how to improve the targeting and impact of the program. These meetings provided the opportunity for the IFPRI team to explain how the evidence from the evaluation relates to policy decisions about the program’s design. These dialogues with MOSS and other stakeholders are likely to have improved these organizations’ understanding of how the program is shaping outcomes for poor households.

**Climate Change relevance:** 0 - Not Targeted

**Other cross-cutting dimensions:** <Not Defined>

**Other cross-cutting dimensions description:** N/A

**Outcome Impact Case Report link:** Study #2171

**Contact person:**
Daniel Gilligan  
Deputy Division Director  
PIM Flagship 4 Leader  
PIM/IFPRI  
d.gilligan@cgiar.org

Clemens Breisinger  
Senior Research Fellow  
PIM/IFPRI  
c.breisinger@cgiar.org